

# CONTENTS

JANUARY 9-11, 2006

## STATEMENTS OF COMMITTEE MEMBERS

	Page
Biden, Hon. Joseph R., Jr., a U.S. Senator from the State of Delaware .....	15
Brownback, Hon. Sam, a U.S. Senator from the State of Kansas .....	44
Coburn, Hon. Tom, a U.S. Senator from the State of Oklahoma .....	47
Cornyn, Hon. John, a U.S. Senator from the State of Texas .....	39
DeWine, Hon. Mike, a U.S. Senator from the State of Ohio .....	24
Durbin, Hon. Richard J., a U.S. Senator from the State of Illinois .....	41
Feingold, Hon. Russell D., a U.S. Senator from the State of Wisconsin .....	31
Feinstein, Hon. Dianne, a U.S. Senator from the State of California .....	26
Graham, Hon. Lindsey O., a U.S. Senator from the State of South Carolina .....	33
Grassley, Hon. Charles E., a U.S. Senator from the State of Iowa .....	13
Hatch, Hon. Orrin G., a U.S. Senator from the State of Utah .....	8
Kennedy, Hon. Edward M., a U.S. Senator from the State of Massachusetts .....	10
Kohl, Hon. Herbert, a U.S. Senator from the State of Wisconsin .....	21
Kyl, Hon. Jon, a U.S. Senator from the State of Arizona .....	18
Leahy, Hon. Patrick J., a U.S. Senator from the State of Vermont .....	5
prepared statement .....	1229
Schumer, Hon. Charles E., a U.S. Senator from the State of New York .....	36
prepared statement .....	1443
Sessions, Hon. Jeff, a U.S. Senator from the State of Alabama .....	28
Specter, Hon. Arlen, a U.S. Senator from the State of Pennsylvania .....	2

## PRESENTERS

Lautenberg, Hon. Frank R., a U.S. Senator from the State of New Jersey presenting Samuel A. Alito, Jr., Nominee to be an Associate Justice of the Supreme Court of the United States .....	50
Whitman, Christine Todd, former Governor of New Jersey, and former Ad- ministrator, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, presenting Samuel A. Alito, Jr., Nominee to be an Associate Justice of the Supreme Court of the United States .....	51

## STATEMENT OF THE NOMINEE

Alito, Samuel A., Jr., of New Jersey, Nominee to be an Associate Justice of the Supreme Court of the United States .....	54
Questionnaire .....	58

JANUARY 12, 2006

## WITNESSES

Aldisert, Ruggero J., Senior Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania .....	659
Axelrod, Edna Ball, Attorney at Law, Law Offices of Edna Ball Axelrod, South Orange, New Jersey .....	681
Barry, Maryanne Trump, Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania .....	658
Becker, Edward R., Senior Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania .....	654

IV

	Page
Garth, Leonard I., Senior Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit, Chicago, Illinois .....	661
Gerhardt, Michael J., Samuel Ashe Distinguished Professor of Constitutional Law, University of North Carolina School of Law, Chapel Hill, North Carolina .....	683
Gibbons, John J., Judge (retired), U.S. Court of Appeals, and Director, Gibbons, Del Deo, Dolan, Griffinger & Vecchione, Newark, New Jersey .....	664
Issacharoff, Samuel, Reiss Professor of Constitutional Law, New York University, New York, New York .....	687
Kirsanow, Peter N., U.S. Commission on Civil Rights, and Partner, Benesch Friedlander Coplan & Aronoff, LLP, Cleveland, Ohio .....	685
Lewis, Timothy K., Judge (retired), U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit, and Counsel, Schnader Harrison Segal & Lewis, LLP, Washington, D.C. ....	667
Liu, Goodwin, Assistant Professor of Law, Boalt Hall School of Law, University of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, California .....	690
Phillips, Carter G., Managing Partner, Sidley Austin, LLP, Washington, D.C. ....	689
Scirica, Anthony J., Chief Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania .....	656
Tober, Stephen L., Esq., Chairman, American Bar Association Standing Committee on the Federal Judiciary, Portsmouth New Hampshire; accompanied by Marna Tucker, Esq., D.C. Circuit Representative, American Bar Association Standing Committee on the Federal Judiciary, Washington, D.C.; and John Payton, Esq., Federal Circuit Representative, American Bar Association Standing Committee on the Federal Judiciary, Washington, D.C. ....	641

**JANUARY 13, 2006**

WITNESSES

Chemerinsky, Erwin, Alston & Bird Professor of Law and Political Science, Duke University Law School, Durham, North Carolina .....	708
Demleitner, Nora V., Vice Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law, Hofstra University School of Law, Hempstead, New York .....	706
Flynn, John G.S., retired Professor of Law, Northeastern University School of Law, Boston, Massachusetts .....	738
Fried, Charles, former Solicitor General of the United States, and Beneficial Professor of Law, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, Massachusetts .....	713
Frost, Amanda, Assistant Professor of Law, Washington College of Law, American University, Washington, D.C. ....	736
Gonzalez, Hon. Charles A., a Representative in Congress from the State of Texas .....	750
Gray, Fred D., Senior Partner, Gray, Langford, Sapp, McGowan, Gray & Nathanson, Tuskegee, Alabama .....	728
Kronman, Anthony, Sterling Professor of Law and former Dean, Yale Law School, New Haven, Connecticut .....	710
Michelman, Kate, former President, National Abortion and Reproductive Rights Action League Pro-Choice America, Washington, D.C. ....	731
Nolan, Beth, Partner, Crowell & Moring, LLP, Washington, D.C. ....	711
Pringle, Katherine L., Partner, Friedman Kaplan Seiler & Adelman LLP, New York, New York .....	748
Shaw, Theodore M., Director-Counsel and President, NAACP Legal Defense and Educational Fund, Inc. ....	758
Sullivan, Ronald S., Jr., Associate Clinical Professor of Law, and Senior Fellow, Jamestown Project, Yale Law School, New Haven, Connecticut .....	733
Tribe, Laurence H., Carl M. Loeb University Professor and Professor of Constitutional Law, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, Massachusetts .....	714
Turner, Reginald M., Jr., President, National Bar Association, Washington, D.C. ....	756
Wasserman Schultz, Hon. Debbie, a Representative in Congress from the State of Florida .....	752
White, Jack, Associate, Kirkland and Ellis, LLP, San Francisco, California .....	754

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

Responses of Samuel A. Alito, Jr. to questions submitted by Senators Biden, Durbin, Kennedy, Leahy, Levin, Schumer, and Feingold .....	773
Responses of Erwin Chemerinsky to questions submitted by Senators Coburn and Kennedy .....	813
Response of Laurence Tribe to a question submitted by Senator Coburn .....	816

## SUBMISSIONS FOR THE RECORD

Aldisert, Ruggero J., Senior Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, prepared statement .....	819
Alliance for Justice, Nan Aron, President, Washington, D.C., letter and attachment .....	823
American Association for Affirmative Action, Shirley J. Wilcher, Interim Executive Director, Washington, letter .....	839
American Association of University Women, Lisa M. Maatz, Director, Public Policy and Government Relations, Washington, D.C., letter .....	841
American Bar Association, Stephen L. Tober, Chair, Washington, D.C.: letter, January 4, 2006 .....	843
letter, January 9, 2006 .....	845
American Civil Liberties Union, Washington, D.C.: Shin Inouy, Legislative Office, January 9, 2006, press release .....	865
Anthony D. Romero, Executive Director, prepared statement .....	867
American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations, John J. Sweeney, President, Washington, D.C., letter .....	875
American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees, Gerald W. McEntee, International President, Washington, D.C., letter .....	877
Americans United for Separation of Church and State, Rev. Barry W. Lynn, Executive Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	879
ADA Watch/National Coalition for Disability Rights, Jim Ward, Founder and President, Washington, D.C., letter .....	881
Asian American Justice Center, Karen K. Narasaki, President and Executive Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	883
Attorneys General of various States, joint letter .....	885
Axelrod, Edna Ball, Attorney at Law, South Orange, New Jersey, prepared statement .....	888
Bar Association of San Francisco, Joan Haratani, President, San Francisco, California, letter .....	892
Bazon Center for Mental Health Law, Robert Bernstein, Executive Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	897
Becker, Edward R., Senior Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, prepared statement .....	899
B'nai B'rith International, Joel S. Kaplan, President and Daniel S. Mariaschin, Executive Vice President, Washington, D.C., letter .....	904
Boston Globe, Boston, Massachusetts, January 10, 2006, article .....	905
Brady Center to Prevent Gun Violence, Washington, D.C.: Mike Barnes, President, letter .....	908
Dennis A. Henigan, Director, Legal Action Project, prepared statement ....	910
California Women Lawyers, Pearl Gondrella Mann, President, Sacramento, California, letter .....	930
Catholics for a Free Choice, Frances Kissling, President, Washington, D.C., letter .....	934
Center for Reproductive Rights, New York, New York, prepared statement ....	937
Chemerinsky, Erwin, Alston & Bird Professor of Law and Political Science, Duke University Law School, Durham, North Carolina, prepared statement .....	946
Chertoff, Michael, Secretary, Department of Homeland Security, Washington, D.C., press release .....	957
Chicago Tribune, Steven Lubet and David McGowan, November 18, 2005, article .....	958
Colorado Hispanic Bar Association, Victoria Lovato, President, Denver, Colorado, letter .....	960
Congressional Hispanic Caucus, Hon. Grace Flores Napolitano, Chair, and Hon. Charles A. Gonzales, Chair, Congressional Hispanic Caucus Civil Rights Task Force, Washington, D.C.: January 6, 2006, letter .....	963
January 20, 2006, letter .....	967

	Page
Congress of the United States, women Members of Congress, Washington, D.C., letter .....	969
Daily Princetonian, Princeton, New Jersey, article .....	972
Deans or former deans of law schools, joint letter .....	976
Demleitner, Nora V., Vice Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law, Hofstra University School of Law, Hempstead, New York, prepared statement .....	979
Dujack, Stephen R., Alexandria, Virginia, prepared statement .....	982
Earthjustice, Vawter Parker, Executive Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	992
Factual responses to falsehoods in the Knight-Ridder article attacking Judge Alito, list .....	994
Fellow judges criticize application of precedent, list .....	998
Feminist Majority, Eleanor Smeal, President, Arlington, Virginia, letter .....	1000
Ferrara, Ralph C., former General Counsel of the Securities and Exchange Commission, and Partner, LeBoeuf, Lamb, Greene & MacRae LLP, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1002
Fleming, Cathy, Edwards Angell Palmer & Dodge, LLP, New York, New York, letter .....	1006
Flynn, John G.S., retired Professor of Law, Northeastern University School of Law, Boston, Massachusetts, prepared statement .....	1008
Former law clerks of Judge Samuel A. Alito, Jr., joint letter .....	1024
Fraternal Order of Police, Grand Lodge, Chuck Canterbury, National President, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1029
Fried, Charles, former Solicitor General of the United States, and Beneficial Professor of Law, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, Massachusetts, prepared statement .....	1031
Friends of the Earth, Brent Blackwelder, President, Washington, D.C., letter ..	1037
Frost, Amanda, Assistant Professor of Law, Washington College of Law, American University, Washington, D.C., prepared statement .....	1039
Garth, Leonard I., Senior Judge, U.S. Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit, Chicago, Illinois, prepared statement .....	1050
Gerhardt, Michael J., Samuel Ashe Distinguished Professor of Constitutional Law, University of North Carolina School of Law, Chapel Hill, North Carolina, prepared statement .....	1060
Gibbons, John J., Judge (retired), U.S. Court of Appeals, and Director, Gibbons, Del Deo, Dolan, Griffinger & Vecchione, Newark, New Jersey, prepared statement .....	1079
Gillers, Stephen, Emily Kempin Professor of Law, New York University School of Law, New York, New York, letter .....	1091
Gonzales, Hon. Charles A., a Representative in Congress from the State of Texas, prepared statement .....	1096
Gray, Fred D., Senior Partner, Gray, Langford, Sapp, McGowan, Gray & Nathanson, Tuskegee, Alabama, prepared statement .....	1105
Hazard, Geoffrey C., Jr., Trustee Professor of Law, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, letter .....	1114
Higginbotham, Michael, Wilson Elkins Professor of Law, University of Baltimore School of Law, Baltimore, Maryland, letter .....	1118
Human Rights Campaign, Joe Solmonese, President, Washington, D.C. prepared statement and letter .....	1120
Independent Living Center of Kern County, Norris Ledbetter, System Change Coordinator, and Bonita Coyle, Executive Director, Bakersfield, California, letter .....	1126
Independent Living Resource Center San Francisco, Herb Levine, Executive Director, San Francisco, California, letter .....	1131
Instances of judges testifying during Supreme Court confirmation hearings, list .....	1133
Ipas, Charlotte Hord Smith, Policy Director, Chapel Hill, North Carolina, letter .....	1134
Issacharoff, Samuel, Reiss Professor of Constitutional Law, New York University, New York, New York, prepared statement .....	1136
Jackson Lee, Hon. Sheila, a Representative in Congress from the State of Texas, letter .....	1140
Japanese American Citizens League, John Tateishi, National Executive Director, San Francisco, California, letter .....	1149
Jewish Community Action, Vic Rosenthal, Executive Director, St. Paul, Minnesota, prepared statement .....	1151
Jewish Council on Urban Affairs, Chicago, Illinois, prepared statement .....	1153

VII

	Page
Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry, Malden, Massachusetts, article ...	1155
Kirsanow, Peter N., U.S. Commission on Civil Rights, and Partner, Benesch Friedlander Coplan & Aronoff, LLP, Cleveland, Ohio, prepared statement ...	1164
Kronman, Anthony, Sterling Professor of Law and former Dean, Yale Law School, New Haven, Connecticut, prepared statement .....	1176
Lambda Legal, Kevin M. Cathcart, Executive Director, New York, New York, letter .....	1180
Law professors who oppose the confirmation of Judge Alito, joint letter .....	1182
Law professors who support the confirmation of Judge Alito, joint letter .....	1208
Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under Law, Marjorie Press Lindblom, Co-Chair and Robert E. Harrington, Co-Chair, Washington, D.C., prepared statement and letter .....	1210
Leadership Conference on Civil Rights, Dorothy I. Height, Chairperson, and Wade Henderson, Executive Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1216
League of United Latin American Citizens, Washington, D.C., press release ...	1227
Legal Momentum, Lisalyn R. Jacobs, Vice President for Government Rela- tions, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1232
Legal professionals in support of the nomination of Judge Samuel A. Alito, Jr., joint letter .....	1234
Liu, Goodwin, Assistant Professor of Law, Boalt Hall School of Law, Univer- sity of California, Berkeley, Berkeley, California, prepared statement .....	1245
Mabel Wadsworth Women's Health Center, Ruth Lockhart, Executive Direc- tor, Sharon Barker, President, Board of Directors, and Stephanie Cotsirilos, past President, Board of Directors, Bangor, Maine, letter .....	1262
Mexican American Legal Defense and Educational Fund, Ann Marie Tallman, President, General Counsel, Los Angeles, California, prepared statement ....	1268
Michelman, Kate, former President, National Abortion and Reproductive Rights Action League Pro-Choice America, Washington, D.C., prepared statement .....	1271
Morgan, Thomas D., Oppenheim Professor of Antitrust and Trade Regulation Law, George Washington School of Law, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1276
National Association for the Advancement of Colored People, Hilary O. Shelton, Director, Washington Bureau, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1279
NAACP Legal Defense and Educational Fund, Inc., Theodore M. Shaw, Direc- tor-Counsel and President, Washington, D.C., prepared statement and at- tachment .....	1281
NARAL Pro-Choice America, Nancy Keenan, President, Washington, D.C., prepared statement and letter .....	1289
National Abortion Federation, Vicki A. Saporta, President and Chief Execu- tive Officer, Washington, D.C., prepared statement and letter .....	1298
National Association of Social Workers, Elizabeth J. Clark, Executive Direc- tor, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1304
National Association of Women Lawyers, Stephanie A. Scharf, Chair, Com- mittee for the Evaluation of Supreme Court Nominees, Chicago, Illinois, letter and attachment .....	1305
National Cancer Institute, U.S. National Institutes of Health, Washington, D.C., report and fact sheets .....	1308
National Council of Jewish Women, Phyllis Snyder, President, New York, New York, prepared statement and letter .....	1323
National Council of Women's Organizations, Susan Scanlan, Chair, and Terry O'Neil, Executive Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1328
National Council on Independent Living, John Lancaster, Executive Director, and Kelly Buckland, President, Arlington, Virginia, letter .....	1329
National District Attorneys Association, Paul A. Logli, President, and Thomas J. Charron, Executive Director, Alexandria, Virginia, letter and resolution ..	1334
National Employment Lawyers Association, Marissa M. Tirona, Program Di- rector, San Francisco, California, letter .....	1336
National Family Planning and Reproductive Health Association, Judith M. DeSarno, President, Chief Executive Officer, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1337
National Gay and Lesbian Task Force, Matt Foreman, Executive Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1338
National Journal Group Inc., Washington, D.C.:	
December 12, 2005, article .....	1340
January 9, 2006, article .....	1344
National Latina Institute for Reproductive Health, Silvia Henriquez, Execu- tive Director, New York, New York, letter .....	1347

VIII

	Page
National Organization for Women, Kim Gandy, President, Washington, D.C., prepared statement and letter .....	1349
National Partnership for Women & Families, Debra L. Ness, President, Washington, D.C., letter and prepared statement .....	1352
National Urban League, Marc H. Morial, President and Chief Executive Officer, New York, New York, letter .....	1382
National Women's Law Center, Nancy Duff Campbell, Co-President and Marcia D. Greenberger, Co-President, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1383
Nolan, Beth, Partner, Crowell & Moring, LLP, Washington, D.C., prepared statement .....	1386
Pennsylvania State Senators in support of Judge Samuel Alito, Harrisburg, Pennsylvania, joint letter .....	1395
People For the American Way, Ralph G. Neas, President, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1398
Phillips, Carter G., Managing Partner, Sidley Austin, LLP, Washington, D.C., prepared statement .....	1400
Physicians for Reproductive Choice and Health, Wendy Chavkin, MD, MPH, Board Chair, New York, New York, prepared statement .....	1405
Planned Parenthood of America and Planned Parenthood Action Fund, Karen Pearl, Interim President, Washington, D.C., letter and prepared statement ..	1408
Precedents Justice Thomas has called for unraveling, list .....	1417
Princeton Packet, Princeton, New Jersey, February 12, 1985, article .....	1420
Pringle, Katherine L., Partner, Friedman Kaplan Seiler & Adelman, LLP, New York, New York, prepared statement .....	1422
Reach Out America, Dorothy Puryear, Executive Committee, and Sybil Bank, Executive Committee, Great Neck, New York, letter .....	1425
Religious Action Center of Reform Judaism, Rabbi David Saperstein, Director and Counsel, and Jane Wishner, Chair, Commission on Social Action of Reform Judaism, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1426
Religious Coalition for Reproductive Choice, Reverend Carlton W. Veazey, President and CEO, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1429
Republican Majority for Choice, Washington, D.C., January 11, 2006, press release .....	1431
Rotunda, Ronald D., George Mason University Foundation Professor of Law, George Mason University School of Law, Arlington, Virginia, letter .....	1433
Sergeants Benevolent Association, Police Department, City of New York, Ed Mullins, President, New York, New York, letter .....	1448
Service Employees International Union, Andrew L. Stern, International President, and Anna Burger, International Secretary-Treasurer, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1450
Shaw, Theodore M., Director-Counsel and President, NAACP Legal Defense & Educational Fund, Inc., Washington, D.C., prepared statement .....	1456
Sierra Club, Patrick Gallagher, Director, Environmental Law Program, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1460
Sullivan, Ronald S., Jr., Associate Clinical Professor of Law, and Senior Fellow, Jamestown Project, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut, prepared statement .....	1464
Sydney Morning Herald, Sydney, Australia, January 3, 2006, article .....	1491
Tober, Stephen L., Esq., American Bar Association, Washington, D.C., prepared statement .....	1493
Tribe, Laurence H., Carl M. Loeb University Professor and Professor of Constitutional Law, Harvard Law School, Cambridge, Massachusetts, prepared statement .....	1498
Turner, Reginald M., Jr., President, National Bar Association, Washington, D.C., prepared statement .....	1519
Union of Orthodox Jewish Congregations of America, Institute for Public Affairs, Mark Bane, Chair, and Nathan J. Diament, Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1536
Unitarian Universalist Association of Congregations, Robert C. Keithan, Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1540
United Automobile, Aerospace and Agricultural Implement Workers of America, Alan Reuther, Legislative Director, letter .....	1543
Violence Policy Center, M. Kristen Rand, Legislative Director, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1545
Walk, R. David, Jr., Dechert LLP, Swarthmore, Pennsylvania, letter .....	1548
Wall Street Journal, New York, New York, January 5, 2006, article .....	1550

## IX

	Page
Washington Post, Washington, D.C.:	
January 2, 2006, article .....	1556
January 8, 2006, article .....	1558
January 9, 2006, article .....	1564
Washington Times, Washington, D.C., January 13, 2006, article .....	1570
Wasserman Schultz, Hon. Debbie, a Representative in Congress from the State of Florida, prepared statement .....	1572
White, Jack, Associate, Kirkland & Ellis LLP, Washington, D.C., prepared statement .....	1581
Women of Reform Judaism, Shelley Lindauer, Executive Director, and Rosanne M. Selfon, President, Lancaster, Pennsylvania, letter .....	1585
Women's Medical Fund, Inc., Anne Nicol Gaylor, Administrator, Madison, Wisconsin, letter .....	1586
YWCA USA, Peggy Sanchez Mills, Chief Executive Officer, Washington, D.C., letter .....	1587