

Committee on Environment and Public Works: Mr. Smith of New Hampshire (Chairman), Mr. Warner, Mr. Inhofe, Mr. Thomas, Mr. Bond, Mr. Voinovich, Mr. Crapo, Mr. Bennett, Mrs. Hutchison, and Mr. Chafee.

Committee on Ethics: Mr. Roberts (Chairman), Mr. Smith of New Hampshire, and Mr. Voinovich.

SENATE RESOLUTION 230—EX-PRESSING THE SENSE OF THE SENATE WITH RESPECT TO GOVERNMENT DISCRIMINATION IN GERMANY BASED ON RELIGION OR BELIEF

Mr. ENZI (for himself and Ms. LANDRIEU) submitted the following resolution; which was referred to the Committee on Foreign Relations:

S. RES. 230

Whereas government discrimination in Germany against individuals and groups based on religion or belief violates Germany's obligations under the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, and the Helsinki Accords, which provide that member states must "recognize and respect the freedom of the individual to profess and practice alone or in community with others, religion or belief acting in accordance with the dictates of his own conscience";

Whereas the 1993 through 1998 State Department Country Reports on Human Rights Practices in Germany have disclosed acts of Federal, State, and local government discrimination in Germany against members of minority religious groups, including Charismatic Christians, Muslims, Jehovah's Witnesses, and Scientologists;

Whereas State Department Human Rights Reports on Germany have also disclosed acts of government discrimination against United States citizens because of their religious beliefs;

Whereas State Department Human Rights Reports on Germany have disclosed discrimination based on religion or belief in Germany in such forms as exclusion from government employment and political parties; the use of "sect-filters" (required declarations that a person or company is not affiliated with a particular religious group) by government, businesses, sports clubs, and other organizations; government-approved boycotts and discrimination against businesses; and the prevention of artists from performing or displaying their works;

Whereas United Nations reports have disclosed discrimination based on religion or belief in Germany, and a 1997 report by the United Nations Special Rapporteur for Religious Intolerance concluded that the Government of Germany "must implement a strategy to prevent intolerance in the field of religion and belief";

Whereas the 1998 report of the State Department's Advisory Committee on Religious Freedom Abroad warned that unless the work of the German Government's Parliamentary Inquiry Commission on "so-called sects and psycho-groups", which investigated dozens of religious groups, including Mormons and other minority Christian groups, "focuses [its] work on investigating illegal acts, [it] runs the risk of denying individuals the right to freedom of religion or belief", and the Committee specifically reported that "members of the Church of Scientology and of a Christian charismatic church have been subject to intense scrutiny

by the Commission, and several members have suffered harassment, discrimination, and threats of violence"; and

Whereas in 1997, a United States immigration judge granted a German woman asylum in the United States, finding that she had a well-founded fear of persecution based on her religious beliefs if she returned to Germany: Now, therefore, be it

Resolved, That the Senate—

(1) urges the Government of Germany to uphold its commitments to "take effective measures to prevent and eliminate discrimination against individuals or communities on the grounds of religion or belief" and "foster a climate of mutual tolerance and respect between believers of different communities", as required by the Organization on Security and Cooperation in Europe's Vienna Concluding Document of 1989;

(2) urges the Government of Germany to enter into a constructive dialogue with minority groups subject to government discrimination based on religion or belief;

(3) continues to hold the Government of Germany responsible for protecting the right of freedom of religion or belief of United States citizens who are living, performing, doing business, or traveling in Germany; and

(4) calls upon the President to assert the concern of the United States Government to the Government of Germany regarding government discrimination in Germany based on religion or belief.

● Mr. ENZI. Mr. President, I rise to submit a resolution concerning religious discrimination in Germany with my colleague, the distinguished Senator from Louisiana, Ms. LANDRIEU. The resolution urges the German government to eliminate religious discrimination within its country because I believe, as a matter of general government policy, no religion or belief should be discriminated against. Anytime the government collects or allows businesses to collect and use information that marks an individual as being different, it is discriminatory and it is wrong. This is a human rights issue. An individual or a group should be allowed to worship in private without public repercussions.

A letter sent to me from the Department of State in August, states "Wherever it may occur, discrimination against an individual or group is a fundamental human rights violation, and the United States government is still very concerned about incidents of discrimination in Germany." The Department of State Human Rights Reports on Germany have disclosed discrimination based on religion or belief in Germany in such forms as: exclusion from government employment and political parties; the use of "sect-filters" (required declarations that a person or company is not affiliated with a particular religious group) by government, businesses, sport clubs, and other organizations; government-approved boycotts and discrimination against businesses; and, the prevention of artists from performing or displaying their works.

I also am aware of the possibilities of United States companies based in Germany being coerced by the German

government to discriminate against American and other employees based on their beliefs. We have a number of German companies conducting business in the United States. I do not want to see these discriminatory practices imported to our country. This issue of government discrimination is not solely contained within the borders of Germany.

The resolution is simple and straightforward. It urges the German government to enter into a constructive dialogue with minority groups subject to government discrimination based on religion or belief. The resolution also calls upon the president to assert the United States' concern to Germany regarding government discrimination based on religion or belief.

If the goal of a world functioning under a flag of democratic freedom is to be realized, the leaders of the free world must set the example. Germany is a leader in the European and world communities. Germany also is a strong United States ally. It is my hope that the German government will allow its country men and women to be leaders of a free society where an individual's beliefs are the sole decision of the individual rather than a matter of state.

Mr. President, I would like to submit for the RECORD a letter I sent to the Department of State on July 16, 1999 as well as the Department of State's response to my letter.

The material follows:

UNITED STATES SENATE,

Washington, DC, July 16, 1999.

Hon. MARC GROSSMAN,
Assistant Secretary of State for European Affairs, State Department, Washington, DC.

DEAR MR. GROSSMAN: Over the past six years there has been a steady increase in the number of religious freedom violations in Germany. These violations have been noted in the State Department Human Rights Country Reports on Germany and the 1998 report of the State Department Advisory Committee on Religious Freedom. They have also been a matter of concern to various human rights groups. All of these reports have described both government and private sector discrimination against individuals and groups, including American citizens, because of their religious beliefs.

Last November, several of my colleagues in the Senate and I wrote to Chancellor Schroeder to express our concerns about this discrimination and the need for dialogue between the German Government and representatives of various religious groups. When we finally received a reply to our inquiry from the German Foreign Office in March, it was accompanied with a copy of the "Religious Freedom" section of the 1998 State Department Human Rights Report on Germany with a note stating that the 1998 Report revised "certain views found in former reports." We were quite disappointed that the Foreign Office reply largely ignored our concerns. While I do not share the German view that the 1998 Human Rights Report signaled that the State Department is no longer concerned with religious discrimination in Germany, I find the German Government's perception of the Report troubling.

One religious group in Germany that has been the subject of the State Department reports is the Christian Community in Cologne

(CCK), an 1,100 member Church headed by an American, Pastor Terry Jones. The 1998 Report stated that virtually no incidents of harassment, discrimination, or death threats have been directed at CCK members since 1992. However, I have seen statements from Pastor Jones, along with other reports and news stories that indicate that the CCK has been the subject of discrimination since 1992. Tax difficulties aside, the CCK has been subject to harassment by government "sect" commissions, threats of violence, and members being denied jobs and child custody because of their Church affiliation. The sources of these reports include the 1998 Interim Report of the State Department Advisory Committee on Religious Freedom Abroad; an April 1998 CNN Worldview story; the testimony of a CCK representative at a September 1997 hearing before the Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe (CSCE); and a May 1997 Report from the British House of Lords. Also, in testimony before the CSCE in July 1998, a representative from the Center for the Study of New Religious Movements criticized Germany for police raids that have occurred against small, independent Pentacostal churches. The Universal Life Church has also suffered discrimination in Germany. Press reports indicate that members of this Christian Church lost their jobs, not because of any wrongdoing, but because of their commitment to their faith.

Another minority group that has been subject to significant discrimination in Germany is the Church of Scientology and its members. The documentation of discrimination against both Americans and Germans based solely on their Church membership seems irrefutable. I especially find the growing governmental use and sponsorship of "sect-filters" disturbing. Nonetheless, in spite of all this evidence and documentation, the German Government seems to believe the State Department has revised its views as to the existence of religious discrimination in their country. I have also seen media reports that characterized the 1998 Report as effectively ending earlier State Department criticism of Germany for its treatment of Scientologists.

I cannot believe these characterizations of the Human Rights Report are an accurate representation of the position of the State Department on these matters. Clearly, the matter of religious discrimination and persecution in Germany needs to be reviewed and the position of the State Department clarified. That review should include a thorough evaluation of the problem, the extent to which the German government is responsible for these actions, and a determination of the appropriate response for these actions, and a determination of the appropriate response of the United States Government to this serious situation.

As I mentioned earlier, the letter sent to Chancellor Schroeder by my Senate colleagues and I expressed the belief that an open and direct dialogue between the German Government and minority religious groups was sorely needed. In particular, I am aware that the State Department had undertaken efforts to establish such a dialogue between the German Government and the Church of Scientology. I applaud this effort. Unfortunately, I understand that the German Government has refused to enter into any such dialogue. Is the State Department considering any steps it can take to encourage such a discussion?

Given Germany's strong commitment to democracy, I am troubled by the continuing reports and the evidence of government

sponsored discrimination in Germany against minority religious groups. For Germany to abide by its international treaty commitments it must respect the beliefs of all religious groups. At whatever level it occurs, it remains the responsibility of the German Federal Government to ensure that the entire country complies with its international human rights treaty obligations. This should especially be true when American citizens are involved.

While I commend the efforts of the State Department to address discrimination in Germany based on religion or belief, it is very important for your Human Rights Country Report on Germany to be clarified so that the position of the State Department on this issue is unmistakably clear. I hope to work with you to resolve these important issues and look forward to your reply to my letter at your earliest opportunity.

Sincerely,

MICHAEL B. ENZI,
U.S. Senator.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF STATE,
Washington, DC, August 25, 1999.

Hon. MICHAEL B. ENZI,
U.S. Senate.

DEAR SENATOR ENZI: Thank you for your July 16 letter regarding religious freedom violations in Germany and the State Department's 1998 Human Rights Report. I am responding on behalf of Assistant Secretary Grossman. Your letter raises several important issues concerning ongoing efforts at the State Department to work with German officials and affected minority groups to end discrimination in Germany based on religion or belief. Wherever it may occur, discrimination against an individual or group is a fundamental human rights violation, and the United States Government is still very concerned about incidents of discrimination in Germany. As the past six years of Human Rights Reports indicate, religious discrimination in Germany continues to take place and the Department of State is committed to addressing issues of religious intolerance.

We, too, were puzzled with characterizations of the 1998 Human Rights Report as ending criticism of Germany. While we would rather devote our time to working with the German government on ways to end discrimination in Germany based on religion or belief, it is also very important to express criticism and concern with ongoing German discriminatory actions and policies. This critical review is one of the primary purposes of the annual Human Rights Report. To interpret the 1998 Report's greater inclusion of German government statements attacking minority groups and rationalizing discriminatory acts and policies as State Department agreement with such statements is wrong.

Perception of the report aside, we are particularly concerned with growing use of sect filters in Germany which prevent a person from practicing his or her profession or participating in public and private fora, solely based on that person's religion or belief. This clearly discriminatory practice is being used by the Federal Ministry of Economics, state governments, private businesses and other organizations in Germany. We have discussed with German state and federal authorities the violation of individual rights posed by sect-filters and will continue our efforts to end the use of such filters.

On the subject of discrimination against the Evangelical churches in Germany, specifically the Christian Community in Cologne (CGK), U.S. Embassy personnel have

met with two associate pastors of the CGK. We have been unable to meet with Pastor Jones, the leader of the church who testified before the Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe in 1997 about discrimination. The two pastors interviewed did describe incidents of religious discrimination in child custody and employment situations. However, until we are able to verify these allegations of discrimination, the State Department is reluctant to include such examples in an official report.

Over the past year, State Department officials in Washington and Germany have undertaken a determined effort to bring together representatives of the Church of Scientology with representatives of the German Federal Government to open a dialogue on issues of concern. To our dismay, the German Government has refused to meet with Scientology representatives. Regardless of what the German Government thinks about the nature and philosophy of Scientology, refusal to enter into a constructive dialogue is troubling. We will continue to press the German Government to take this step.

As your letter correctly states, Germany is obligated by various international human rights treaties to respect the freedom of an individual to worship alone or in community with other religious or beliefs acting in accordance with the dictates of his own conscience. And no matter at what level discrimination occurs, it is the responsibility of the German Federal Government to ensure that the entire country complies with its international human rights treaty obligations. We look forward to working with you and other Members of Congress to that end in Germany.

I hope our response has addressed your concerns. Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have further questions about this or any other matter.

Sincerely,
BARBARA LARKIN,
Assistant Secretary, Legislative Affairs.●

AUTHORITY FOR COMMITTEES TO MEET

COMMITTEE ON ARMED SERVICES

Mr. GRASSLEY. Mr. President, I ask unanimous consent that the Committee on Armed Services be authorized to meet during the session of the Senate on Tuesday, November 9, 1999, at 2:00 p.m. to consider certain pending military nominations.

The PRESIDING OFFICER. Without objection, it is so ordered.

COMMITTEE ON BANKING, HOUSING, AND URBAN AFFAIRS

Mr. GRASSLEY. Mr. President, I ask unanimous consent that the Committee on Banking, Housing, and Urban Affairs be authorized to meet during the session of the Senate on Tuesday, November 9, 1999, to conduct a mark-up on pending nominations.

The PRESIDING OFFICER. Without objection, it is so ordered.

PERMANENT SUBCOMMITTEE ON INVESTIGATIONS

Mr. GRASSLEY. Mr. President, I ask unanimous consent that the Permanent Subcommittee on Investigations of the Governmental Affairs Committee be authorized to meet on Tuesday, November 9, 1999, at 10:00 a.m., for a hearing entitled "Private Banking