

CHAPTER 9

Election Contests

A. In General

- § 1. Constitutional Provisions; Historical Background
- § 2. Contested Election Laws
- § 3. State or Local Election Boards

B. Jurisdiction and Powers

- § 4. The House
- § 5. Election Committees
- § 6. The Clerk; Transmittal of Papers
- § 7. The Courts

C. Grounds of Contest

- § 8. Generally
- § 9. Faulty Credentials; Citizenship
- § 10. Violation of Federal or State Election Laws
- § 11. Improper Attempts to Influence or Confuse Voters
- § 12. Voting Booth and Balloting Irregularities

D. Defenses

- § 13. Generally
- § 14. Contestant's Credentials and Qualifications
- § 15. Abatement
- § 16. Limitations and Laches

E. Practice and Procedure

- § 17. Alternatives to Statutory Election Contests
- § 18. Commencing the Contest

Commentary and editing by John Theodore Fee, J.D.

§ 19. Parties

F. Notice of Contest

§ 20. Generally; Time

§ 21. Service of Notice

§ 22. Form and Contents of Notice

G. Pleading

§ 23. Generally

§ 24. Answer

§ 25. Motion to Dismiss

§ 26. Motion for More Definite Statement

H. Taking of Testimony; Depositions

§ 27. Generally; Time

§ 28. Examination of Parties and Witnesses

§ 29. Scope of Examination; Objections

§ 30. Subpenas

§ 31. Affidavits

I. Committee Hearing and Review; Dismissal and Withdrawal

§ 32. Generally; Preparation of Briefs

§ 33. Dismissal and Withdrawal of Contest

J. Evidence

§ 34. Generally

§ 35. Burden of Proof

§ 36. Presumptions

§ 37. Ballots

§ 38. Determination of Voter Intention

K. Inspection and Recount of Ballots

§ 39. Generally

§ 40. Grounds

§ 41. Procedure

L. Disposition of Contests; Resolutions

§ 42. Generally

§ 43. Committee Reports

§ 44. Form of Resolutions

§ 45. Costs and Expenses; Compensation and Allowances

M. Summaries of Election Contests, 1931–72

§ 46. Seventy-second Congress, 1931–32

§ 47. Seventy-third Congress, 1933–34

§ 48. Seventy-fourth Congress, 1935–36

§ 49. Seventy-fifth Congress, 1937–38

§ 50. Seventy-sixth Congress, 1939–40

§ 51. Seventy-seventh Congress, 1941–42

§ 52. Seventy-eighth Congress, 1943–44

§ 53. Seventy-ninth Congress, 1945–46

§ 54. Eightieth Congress, 1947–48

§ 55. Eighty-first Congress, 1949–50

§ 56. Eighty-second Congress, 1951–52

§ 57. Eighty-fifth Congress, 1957–58

§ 58. Eighty-sixth Congress, 1959–60

§ 59. Eighty-seventh Congress, 1961–62

§ 60. Eighty-eighth Congress, 1963–64

§ 61. Eighty-ninth Congress, 1965–66

§ 62. Ninetieth Congress, 1967–68

§ 63. Ninety-first Congress, 1969–70

§ 64. Ninety-second Congress, 1971–72

Appendix

Election Contests, 1917–31

INDEX TO PRECEDENTS

- Abernethy et al. v Wheadon et al., Mississippi 1965, §61.2**
- Advisory opinions as to state law, §§5.13, 5.14**
- Alford, investigation of right to seat, Arkansas 1959, §58.1**
- Alternatives to statutory election contests, §§17.1–17.4**
- Answer, failure to make timely, §24.1**
- Ayres v Huber, Ohio 1951, §56.1**
- Ballot boxes, magistrate's authority to open, §7.7**
- Balloting irregularities, §§12.2–12.8**
- Ballots**
- ambiguous, interpretation of voter intention, §37.1
 - best evidence for determining voter intention, §37.2
 - committee power to examine and recount, §§5.10, 5.11
 - integrity of, preserving, §§5.7, 5.8, 35.10, 37.19, 37.20
 - interpretation of voter intention, §§38.1–38.3
 - marked for both candidates, §37.15
 - marked in wrong place, §37.16
 - marked with improper instrument, §37.18
 - marked with other than specified mark, §§37.10, 37.11
 - "papers" required to be produced, §§29.2, 29.3
 - preservation of, §§5.7, 5.8, 35.10, 37.19, 37.20
 - recount by stipulation of parties, §§39.1, 39.2
 - recount conducted by federal auditors, §41.5
 - recount justified only if election result affected, §§40.5–40.7
 - recount of, burden of proof to show fraud or mistake before, §§40.3, 40.4
- Ballots—Cont.**
- recount supervised by House, §39.4
 - recount, unsupervised, §39.3
 - stickers used in lieu of writing in name, §§37.13, 37.14
 - stub attached to, §37.17
 - tallies, §37.21
 - "write in," misspelling name on, §37.12
 - writing in name of already listed candidate, effect of, §37.9
- Beck v Shanahan, Pennsylvania 1934, §47.15**
- Blackburn v Mackay, Georgia 1967, §62.2**
- Blackney v Stevens, Michigan 1949, §55.3**
- Booth, see Voting booth**
- Bowles v Dingell, Michigan 1934, §47.1**
- Brewster v Utterback, Maine 1933, §47.2**
- Britten v McAndrews, Illinois 1934, §47.12**
- Browner v Cunningham, Iowa 1949, §55.1**
- Burden of proof (see also Presumptions)**
- claim to seat, establishing, §35.8
 - expenditures, allegations of improper, §35.9
 - recount of ballots, fraud or mistake shown before, §§40.3, 40.8
 - results of election would be changed, §§35.3–35.7, 40.5–40.7
- Burnham v Chandler, California 1934, §47.4**
- Campaign workers, prizes to, as grounds for contest, §11.4**
- Candidate's participation in irregularities, §13.2**
- Carter v LeCompte, Iowa 1957, §57.1**

- Casey v Turpin, Pennsylvania 1934, §47.3**
- Certificates of election, §§9.1–9.3**
- Chambers or Roush, Indiana 1961, §59.1**
- Chandler v Burnham, California 1934, §47.4**
- Citizenship, Member's qualifications as to, §9.4**
- Clark v Nichols, Oklahoma 1943, §52.1**
- Clerk**
- items transmitted to Speaker, §§6.1–6.5
 - notice of contest to, forwarding in prescribed manner of, §25.1
 - powers of, §§6.6–6.13
 - subpena, refusal to respond to party's, §§6.13, 30.1
 - testimony, failure to forward to Clerk, §27.6
- Coad v Dolliver, Iowa 1957, §57.2**
- Colmer v Gray, Mississippi 1965, §61.2**
- Contestant**
- failure to specify grounds relied upon, §13.8
 - standing to bring contest, §§14.1, 19.1–19.6
- Contingent fund, reimbursement of contest expenses from, §§45.1, 45.2**
- Cooper v Miller, Ohio 1936, §48.3**
- Corrupt Practices Act, §§10.1–10.5**
- Cosey et al. v Williams, Mississippi 1965, §61.2**
- Coyle v Kent, Pennsylvania 1932, §46.1**
- Cunningham v Browner, Iowa 1949, §55.1**
- Curtis v Karst, Missouri 1951, §56.2**
- Davies v Fuller, New York 1949, §55.2**
- Davis v Lowe, Georgia 1948, §54.1**
- Davis v Lowe, Georgia 1951, §56.3**
- Davis v Mankin, Georgia 1947, §54.2**
- Debate on resolution disposing of contest**
- extension of time for, §42.9
 - participation by parties, §§42.6, 42.7
- Default judgment, motion for, §23.2**
- Deposition unsigned by witness, §28.1**
- Devine v Walker, Mississippi 1965, §61.2**
- Dingell v Bowles, Michigan 1934, §47.1**
- Directed verdict, motion for, §23.1**
- Directory laws distinguished from mandatory laws, §§10.6–10.12**
- Dismiss, premature motion to, §25.6**
- Dismissal, cause for, §33.1**
- Disney v O'Connor, Oklahoma 1932, §46.3**
- Disposal of contest**
- parties' stipulation as to, §42.10
 - privileged resolutions, §§42.2–42.5
 - resolution declaring seat vacant, §§42.11, 42.12
- Dolliver v Coad, Iowa 1957, §57.2**
- Dondero v Hicks, Michigan 1945, §53.1**
- Douglas v Roberts, California 1947, §54.4**
- Eaton v Scott, California 1940, §50.2**
- Election official**
- directory laws, violations of, §§10.8, 10.10
 - mandatory laws, violations of, §10.7
 - violations and errors by, §§10.13–10.15
 - voter confusion as excuse for entering booth, §12.1
- Elections**
- conducted improperly, §§10.17–10.19
 - illegal, as grounds for contest, §§10.18, 14.2
 - unauthorized, §14.2
- Ellenbogen, In re, Pennsylvania 1933, §47.5**

- Ellis v Thurston, Iowa 1934, § 47.6**
- Ellzey v Reese, Mississippi 1934, § 47.13**
- Evidence** (see also **Burden of proof; Presumptions**)
- ballots as best evidence, § 37.2
 - ex parte proceedings, § 34.3
 - future use, collecting for, § 34.1
 - preservation of, by committee, §§ 5.7–5.9
 - production of contestant's, § 34.2
 - standard of "air preponderance," § 35.2
 - testimony from prior state inquiry, § 34.4
 - withdrawal of, § 32.1
- Expenses of election contests, see Reimbursement of contest expenses**
- "Fair preponderance" of evidence standard, § 35.2**
- Feighan v Thierry, Ohio 1949, § 55.4**
- Felix v Muldowney, Pennsylvania 1934, § 47.7**
- Financing extra editions of magazine as grounds for contest, § 11.2**
- Fox v Higgins, Connecticut 1934, § 47.8**
- Frankenberry v Ottinger, New York 1965, § 61.1**
- Fuller v Davies, New York 1949, § 55.2**
- Funds, illegal use of, § 10.20**
- Gormley v Goss, Connecticut 1934, § 47.9**
- Goss v Gormley, Connecticut 1934, § 47.9**
- Granata v Kunz, Illinois 1932, § 46.2**
- Granger v Wilson, Utah 1948, § 54.5**
- Gray v Colmer, Mississippi 1965, § 61.2**
- Greenwood v Macy, New York 1951, § 56.4**
- Gross v Peterson, Iowa 1965, § 61.3**
- Hale v Oliver, Maine 1958, § 57.3**
- Hamer v Whitten, Mississippi 1965, § 61.2**
- Harrington v Swanson, Iowa 1940, § 50.4**
- Hicks v Dondero, Michigan 1945, § 53.1**
- Higgins v Fox, Connecticut 1934, § 47.8**
- House resolution disposing of contest, see Resolutions disposing of contest**
- Huber v Ayres, Ohio 1951, § 56.1**
- Illegal elections, §§ 10.17–10.19, 14.2**
- Illegal use of funds, § 10.20**
- Invalid elections, see Elections**
- Investigations continuing after adjournment**
- authority for, § 5.12
 - funding for, § 45.1
- Investigations of right to seat, see Alternatives to statutory election contest**
- Jenks v Roy, New Hampshire 1938, § 49.1**
- Joint resolution**
- reimbursement of contest expenses authorized by, § 45.3
- Jurisdiction, notice of contest as basis for House, § 4.1**
- Karst v Curtis, Missouri 1951, § 56.2**
- Kefauver v Neal, Tennessee 1940, § 50.1**
- Kemp, Sanders investigation, Louisiana 1934, § 47.14**
- Kent v Coyle, Pennsylvania 1932, § 46.1**
- King v McCandless, Hawaii 1936, § 48.2**
- Kirwan v Miller, Ohio 1941, § 51.1**
- Kunz v Granata, Illinois 1932, § 46.2**
- Laches, defense to contest, § 16.1**
- LaGuardia v Lanzetta, New York 1934, § 47.10**
- Lanzetta v LaGuardia, New York 1934, § 47.10**

- Lanzetta v Marcantonio, New York 1936, § 48.1**
- LeCompte v Carter, Iowa 1957, § 57.1**
- Lovette v Reece, Tennessee 1934, § 47.11**
- Lowe v Davis, Georgia 1948, § 54.1**
- Lowe v Davis, Georgia 1951, § 56.3**
- Lowe v Thompson, Georgia 1967, § 62.1; 1969, § 63.1**
- Maas v Williams, Minnesota 1937, § 49.3**
- Mackay v Blackburn, Georgia 1967, § 62.2**
- Macy v Greenwood, New York 1951, § 56.4**
- Mahoney v Smith, Kansas 1959, § 58.2**
- Mandatory laws distinguished from directory laws, §§ 10.6–10.12**
- Mankin v Davis, Georgia 1947, § 54.2**
- Marcantonio v Lanzetta, New York 1936, § 48.1**
- McAndrews v Britten, Illinois 1934, § 47.12**
- McCandless v King, Hawaii 1936, § 48.2**
- McEvoy v Peterson, Georgia 1944, § 52.2**
- McMurray v Thill, Wisconsin 1944, § 52.6**
- Members on subcommittee on elections, qualifications of, § 5.4**
- Memorial, see Alternatives to statutory election contest**
- Michael v Smith, Virginia 1947, § 54.3**
- Miller v Cooper, Ohio 1936, § 48.3**
- Miller v Kirwan, Ohio 1941, § 51.1**
- Miller v Sullivan, Missouri 1943, § 52.5**
- Minority reports, §§ 43.7–43.9**
- Mississippi, The Five Cases of, 1965, § 61.2**
- Moreland v Schuetz, Illinois 1943, § 52.3**
- Motion for directed verdict, § 23.1**
- Motion for default judgment, § 23.2**
- Motion to dismiss, premature, § 25.6**
- Muldowney v Felix, Pennsylvania 1934, § 47.7**
- Myers v Springer, Illinois 1959, § 58.3**
- Neal v Kefauver, Tennessee 1940, § 50.1**
- Nichols v Clark, Oklahoma 1943, § 52.1**
- Notice of contest**
- commencement of 30-day period for filing, § 20.5
 - good-faith requirement in filing for reimbursement of expenses, § 45.7
 - signature, necessity of, § 22.4
- Oath, administration of, as evidence of right to seat, § 35.1**
- Oath, administration of candidate's, §§ 4.2, 4.3**
- O'Brien v Woodward, Illinois 1947, § 54.6**
- O'Connor v Disney, Oklahoma 1932, § 46.3**
- Odegard v Olson, Minnesota 1963, § 60.1**
- Oliver v Hale, Maine 1958, § 57.3**
- Olson v Odegard, Minnesota 1963, § 60.1**
- Osser v Scott, Pennsylvania 1951, § 56.5**
- Ottinger v Frankenberry, New York 1965, § 61.1**
- Petition of right to seat, see Alternatives to statutory election contest**
- Peterson v Gross, Iowa 1965, § 61.3**
- Peterson v McEvoy, Georgia 1944, § 52.2**
- Plunkett, In re, 1945, § 53.2**
- Polk v Smith, Ohio 1939, § 50.3**
- Pre-election irregularities**
- courts, appeal to state, § 7.1
- Presumptions (see also Burden of proof)**
- absence of witnesses and challengers for contestant, § 36.8

Presumptions (see also **Burden of proof**)—**Cont.**

closeness of election result, § 36.11
official returns as prima facie evidence, §§ 36.1–36.7

tally sheets, correctness of, § 36.9

Primary election, improperly conducted, § 10.19**Privileged resolutions, disposing of contests, §§ 42.2–42.5****Prizes to campaign workers as grounds for contest, § 11.4****Racial discrimination as grounds for contesting election, § 11.3****Recount of ballots**

burden on contestant to produce evidence justifying, § 41.3

burden on contestant to show fraud or mistake before, § 40.3

conducted by auditors from General Accounting Office, § 41.5

court, state, recount supervised by, § 39.6

exhaustion of state remedies before, § 41.1

House supervision, held pursuant to state law, § 39.4

joint applications for, § 41.4

reconsideration of actions ordering, § 41.6

result of election be affected in order to justify, § 39.5

stipulation of parties to, §§ 39.1, 39.2

unsupervised, § 39.3

Reece v Lovette, Tennessee 1934, § 47.11**Reese v Ellzey, Mississippi 1934, § 47.13****Reimbursement of expenses or allowances**

abatement of contest, request made after, § 45.6

alternatives to statutory election contests, reimbursement to parties in, § 45.4

Reimbursement of expenses or allowances—Cont.

good-faith filing, conditioned upon, § 45.7

House contingent fund, payments from, § 45.1, 45.2

joint resolution authorizing, § 45.3

parties' expenses, § 45.4

retroactive to convening of Congress for Member-elect, § 45.5

Reports on contest by committee

failure to submit to House, §§ 43.13, 43.14

minority, §§ 43.7–43.9

resolutions accompanying, § 43.4

timeliness of, §§ 43.5, 43.6

withdrawal of contest by contestant, reciting, §§ 43.10, 43.12

Representatives on subcommittee on elections, qualifications of, § 5.4**Residency, commencement, determined by state court, § 7.4****Resolutions disposing of contest**

admitting neither candidate to seat, § 42.15

debate upon, extensions of, § 42.9

debate upon, participation of parties in, §§ 42.6–42.8

declaring seat vacant, §§ 42.11, 42.12

form of resolution, §§ 44.1–44.3

language in, appropriateness of, § 44.1

privileged, § 42.2–42.5

several contests treated in same resolution, § 44.3

substitutes to, offering of, § 42.17, 42.18

Roberts v Douglas, California 1947, § 54.4**Roush or Chambers. Indiana 1961. § 59.1****Roy v Jenks, New Hampshire 1938, § 49.1****Rutherford v Taylor, Tennessee 1937, § 49.2**

- Sanders, Kemp investigation, Louisiana 1934, § 47.14**
- Schafer v Wasielewski, Wisconsin 1944, § 52.4**
- Schuetz v Moreland, Illinois 1943, § 52.3**
- Scott v Eaton, California 1940, § 50.2**
- Scott v Osser, Pennsylvania 1951, § 56.5**
- Service, substituted, § 21.1**
- Shanahan v Beck, Pennsylvania 1934, § 47.15**
- Signature necessary on notice of contest, § 22.4**
- Simpson v Weber, Illinois 1934, § 47.16**
- Smith v Mahoney, Kansas 1959, § 58.2**
- Smith v Michael, Virginia 1947, § 54.3**
- Smith v Polk, Ohio 1939, § 50.3**
- Springer v Myers, Illinois 1959, § 58.3**
- Standing**
- contestant's, to bring contest, §§ 14.1, 19.1–19.6
 - third party's, to bring contest, §§ 19.1–19.3
- State law**
- advisory opinions by state courts on, § 7.3
 - advisory opinions by state officials on, § 5.13
 - court, local, adoption or rejection of opinion of, §§ 7.4–7.6, 38.4
 - nominating procedure, illegal, § 10.21
 - voter intention as paramount consideration, § 38.4, 38.5
- State or local elections, intervention in, § 3.2**
- State remedy, effect of failure to exhaust, §§ 13.4, 13.5**
- Stevens v Blackney, Michigan 1949, § 55.3**
- Stickers, see Ballots**
- Stipulation of parties**
- disposal of contest by, § 42.10
- Stipulation of parties—Cont.**
- jurisdiction on Congress, as to conferring, § 4.1
 - recount of ballots, joint applications for, § 41.4
 - time, extensions of, § 27.15
- “Straight ticket” votes, interpretation of, § 37.6–37.8**
- Stubs, see Ballots**
- Subpena**
- Clerk's refusal to respond to, § 30.1
 - noncompliance with, § 30.2
- Substituted service, see Service**
- Sullivan v Miller, Missouri 1943, § 52.5**
- Swanson v Harrington, Iowa 1940, § 50.4**
- Tally sheets, presumption of correctness of, § 36.9**
- Taylor v Rutherford, Tennessee 1937, § 49.2**
- Testimony (see also Evidence)**
- Clerk, failure to forward to, § 25.1, 27.6
 - failure to produce, § 29.1
 - failure to take within statutory period, §§ 15.1–15.3, 27.1–27.5
 - time, extensions of for taking, §§ 27.7–27.10
- Thierry v Feighan, Ohio 1949, § 55.4**
- Thill v McMurray, Wisconsin 1944, § 52.6**
- Thompson v Lowe, Georgia 1967, § 62.1; 1969, § 63.1**
- Thurston v Ellis, Iowa 1934, § 47.6**
- Time**
- extension by stipulation of parties of, § 27.15
 - extension during debate on resolution disposing of contest of, § 42.9
 - extension only for good cause of, §§ 27.11, 27.12
 - extension, subsequent authorization of, § 27.14

Ch. 9

DESCHLER'S PRECEDENTS

- Transmittal of papers, see Clerk**
- Tunno v Veysey, California 1971, §64.1**
- Turpin v Casey, Pennsylvania 1934, §47.3**
- Utterback v Brewster, Maine 1933, §47.2**
- Vacancy, notification to Governor of, §4.6**
- Veysey v Tunno, California 1971, §64.1**
- Voter intention, state law as related to interpreting, §§38.4, 38.5**
- Voters, confusing or misleading as grounds for contest, §11.1**
- Votes, see Ballots**
- Voting booth**
election official entering, voter confusion as excuse for, §12.1
- Walker v Devine, Mississippi 1965, §61.2**
- Wasielowski v Schafer, Wisconsin 1944, §52.4**
- Weber v Simpson, Illinois 1934, §47.16**
- Wheadon et al. v Abernethy et al., Mississippi 1965, §61.2**
- Whitten v Hamer, Mississippi 1965, §61.2**
- Williams v Cosey et al., Mississippi 1965, §61.2**
- Williams v Maas, Minnesota 1937, §49.3**
- Wilson v Granger, Utah 1948, §54.5**
- Withdrawal of contest, §§33.3-33.6**
- Witness, signing of deposition by, §28.1**
- Woodward v O'Brien, Illinois 1947, §54.6**
- "Write in" votes, see Ballots**