

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

IN RE OPTICAL DISK DRIVE PRODUCTS
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

MDL Docket No. 3:10-md-02143 RS

Case No. 3:13-cv-1877-RS

This document relates to:

STATE OF FLORIDA, OFFICE OF THE
ATTORNEY GENERAL, DEPARTMENT
OF LEGAL AFFAIRS,

Plaintiff,

v.

HITACHI-LG DATA STORAGE, INC., et al.

Defendants.

**STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER
REGARDING THE WITHDRAWAL OF
CERTAIN AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,
AND THE STATE OF FLORIDA'S
MOTION TO STRIKE**

1 WHEREAS, on January 24, 2014, Defendants filed a Motion to Dismiss the State of
2 Florida, Office of the Attorney General, Department of Legal Affairs' ("Florida") Amended
3 Complaint for Damages, Civil Penalties, [and] Injunctive Relief ("Motion to Dismiss") (Dkt. 24);

4 WHEREAS, on April 8, 2014, the Court entered an Order Granting in Part and Denying in
5 Part Motion to Dismiss State of Florida's Complaint (Dkt. 28);

6 WHEREAS, on May 19, 2014, Florida filed a Second Amended Complaint for Damages,
7 Civil Penalties, and Injunctive Relief ("Second Amended Complaint") (Dkt. 31);

8 WHEREAS, the undersigned Defendants filed separate Answers to Florida's Second
9 Amended Complaint on or about June 18, 2014 and June 25, 2014, which individually asserted
10 various Affirmative Defenses by each Defendant;

11 WHEREAS, on July 9, 2014, Florida filed a Motion to Strike Defendants' Affirmative
12 Defenses to the State of Florida's Second Amended Complaint ("Motion to Strike") (Dkt. 60),
13 which seeks dismissal of the following four Affirmative Defenses, to the extent asserted by a
14 particular Defendant: (i) Lack of Standing Based on *Mack v. Bristol-Myers Squibb Co.*, 673 So.
15 2d 100 (Fla. 1st DCA 1996) ("*Mack*"); (ii) lack of personal jurisdiction; (iii) improper venue; and
16 (iv) incorporation of other Defendants' defenses (*see* Dkt. 60, Appendix A-D);

17 WHEREAS, the parties have conferred and reached an agreement whereby Defendants
18 agree to withdraw the Affirmative Defenses identified in Appendix A-D of Florida's Motion to
19 Strike from their individual Answers, and Florida agrees to withdraw its Motion to Strike; and

20 WHEREAS, the parties agree that the withdrawal of improper venue as an Affirmative
21 Defense from any Defendant's Answer shall not preclude any party, including either Florida or
22 any Defendant, from later moving the Court to change or transfer the venue of this action.

23 NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED and AGREED, subject to Court
24 approval, that Florida's Motion to Strike (Dkt. 60) shall be deemed withdrawn. In addition, the
25 following four Affirmative Defenses shall be deemed withdrawn, to the extent asserted by any
26 Defendant in its Answer to Florida's Second Amended Complaint: (i) lack of standing based on
27 *Mack*; (ii) lack of personal jurisdiction; (iii) improper venue; and (iv) incorporation of other
28 Defendants' defenses. The withdrawal of improper venue as an Affirmative Defense from any

1 Defendant's Answer shall not preclude any party from subsequently moving this Court to change
2 or transfer the venue of this action.

3 IT IS SO STIPULATED.

4 DATED: August 4, 2014

LATHAM & WATKINS LLP

5
6 By /s/ Belinda S Lee
BELINDA S LEE

7 505 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000
8 San Francisco, CA 94111
9 Telephone: 415-395-8240
10 Facsimile: 415-395-8095
11 belinda.lee@lw.com

12 *Counsel for Defendants Toshiba Samsung Storage
13 Technology Korea Corporation, Toshiba Samsung
14 Storage Technology Corporation, and Toshiba
15 Corporation*

13 DATED: August 4, 2014

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

14 By: /s/ Ian Simmons
15 IAN SIMMONS

16 1625 Eye Street, NW
17 Washington, DC 20006
18 Telephone: (202) 383-5106
19 Facsimile: (202) 383-5414
20 isimmons@omm.com

21 *Counsel for Defendants Samsung Electronics Co.,
22 Ltd. and Samsung Electronics America, Inc.*

21 DATED: August 4, 2014

BOIES SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP

22 By: /s/ John F. Cove, Jr.
23 JOHN F. COVE, JR.

24 1999 Harrison Street, Suite 900
25 Oakland, CA 94612
26 Telephone: (510) 874-1000
27 Facsimile: (510) 874-1460
28 jcove@bsflp.com

*Counsel for Defendants Sony Corporation, Sony
Electronics, Inc., Sony Optiarc Inc., and Sony
Optiarc America Inc.*

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

DATED: August 4, 2014

DLA PIPER LLP

By: /s/ Deana L. Cairo
DEANA L. CAIRO

500 8th Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004
Telephone: (202) 799-4523
Facsimile: (202) 799-5523
Deana.cairo@dlapiper.com

*Counsel for Defendants TEAC Corporation and
TEAC America Inc.*

DATED: August 4, 2014

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

By /s/ Jeffrey L. Kessler
JEFFREY L. KESSLER

200 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10166
Telephone: (212) 294-6700
Facsimile: (212) 294-4700
jkessler@winston.com

*Counsel for Defendants Panasonic Corporation and
Panasonic Corporation of North America*

DATED: August 4, 2014

WINSTON & STRAWN LLP

By /s/ Robert B. Pringle
ROBERT B. PRINGLE

101 California Street
San Francisco, CA 94111-5894
Telephone: (415) 591-1000
Facsimile: (415) 591-1400
rpringle@winston.com

Counsel for Defendant NEC Corporation

DATED: August 4, 2014

ROPES & GRAY LLP

By: /s/ Mark S. Popofsky
Mark S. POPOFSKY

One Metro Center
700 12th Street NW, Suite 900
Washington, DC 20005-3948
Telephone: (202) 508-4600
Facsimile: (202) 508-4650

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

mark.popofsky@ropesgray.com

Counsel for Defendants Hitachi-LG Data Storage, Inc. and Hitachi-LG Data Storage Korea, Inc.

DATED: August 4, 2014

BAKER BOTTS LLP

By: /s/ Evan Werbel
EVAN WERBEL

1299 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20004
Telephone: (202) 383-7199
Facsimile: (202) 383-6610
evan.werbel@bakerbotts.com

Counsel for Defendants Koninklijke Philips N.V., Lite-On IT Corp. of Taiwan, Philips & Lite-On Digital Solutions Corp., and Philips & Lite-On Digital Solutions U.S.A., Inc.

DATED: August 4, 2014

DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP

By: /s/ Lisa M. Kaas
LISA M. KAAS

1825 Eye Street NW
Washington, DC 20006
Telephone: (202) 420-2200
Facsimile: (202) 420-2201
kaasl@dicksteinshapiro.com

Counsel for Defendants BenQ Corporation and BenQ America Corp.

DATED: August 4, 2014

VINSON & ELKINS LLP

By: /s/ Craig P. Seebald
CRAIG P. SEEBALD

2200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Suite 500 West
Washington, DC 20037-1701
Telephone: (202) 639-6500
Facsimile: (202) 879-8950
cseebald@velaw.com

Counsel for Defendant Hitachi, Ltd.

1 DATED: August 4, 2014

JONES DAY

2 By: /s/ Eric P. Enson
3 ERIC P. ENSON

4 555 South Flower Street, Fiftieth Floor
5 Los Angeles, CA 90071
6 Telephone: (213) 489-3939
7 Facsimile: (213) 243-2539
8 epenson@JonesDay.com

9 *Counsel for Defendants Pioneer Electronics (USA)*
10 *Inc., Pioneer North America, Inc., Pioneer*
11 *Corporation, and Pioneer High Fidelity Taiwan*
12 *Co., LTD.*

13 DATED: August 4, 2014

EIMER STAHL LLP

14 By: /s/ Nathan P. Eimer
15 NATHAN P. EIMER

16 224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 100
17 Chicago, IL 60604
18 Telephone: (312) 660-7601
19 Facsimile: (312) 692-1718
20 neimer@eimerstahl.com

21 *Counsel for Defendant LG Electronics, Inc.*

22 DATED: August 4, 2014

DRINKER BIDDLE & REATH LLP

23 By: /s/ Keith A. Walter, Jr.
24 KEITH A. WALTER, JR.

25 222 Delaware Avenue, Suite 1410
26 Wilmington, Delaware 19801
27 Telephone: (302) 467-4200
28 Facsimile: (302) 467-4201
keith.walter@dbr.com

Counsel for Defendants Quanta Storage, Inc. and
Quanta Storage America, Inc.

DATED: August 4, 2014

STATE OF FLORIDA

By /s/ Nicholas J. Weilhammer
NICHOLAS J. WEILHAMMER

Office of the Attorney General
State of Florida
PL-01, The Capitol
Tallahassee, Florida 32399-1050

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Tel: (850) 414-3300
Fax: (850) 488-9134
Liz.Brady@myfloridalegal.com
Nicholas.Weilhammer@myfloridalegal.com

Counsel for Plaintiff State of Florida

Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), the filer attests that concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from each of the signatories.

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: 8/4/14



HONORABLE RICHARD SEBORG
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT JUDGE